Lesson 12 - The Dilemma

What is a dilemma - A valid argument form that presents you with 2 different choices.

2 General Forms;

1. CONSTRUCTIVE DILEMMA:

EX. If I go to college then I delay making money, but if I go straight into business then I will get a low paying job. I will either go to college or straight into business, so I will either delay making money or I will get a low paying job.

FORM 1:  \((p \supset q) \cdot (r \supset s)\)  \(p \lor r\)  \(\therefore q \lor s\)

FORM 2:  \((p \supset q) \cdot (\neg p \supset r)\)  \(p \lor \neg p\)  \(\therefore q \lor r\)

EX. If I go to college then I delay making money but if I don't go to college then I can go straight into business. I will either go to college or go straight into business, so I will either delay making money or I will get a low paying job.

FORM 3:  \((p \supset q) \cdot (r \supset q)\)  \(p \lor r\)  \(\therefore q \lor q\)

EX. If Congressman Jones lied about the sale of arms then he should not be re-elected. Neither should he be re-elected if he honestly couldn’t remember something so important. He either lied or he couldn't remember, so he should not be re-elected.

2. DESTRUCTIVE DILEMMA:

\((p \supset q) \cdot (r \supset s)\)  \(\neg q \lor \neg s\)  \(\therefore \neg p \lor \neg r\)

EX. If you exercise often, you will stay strong, and if you eat well your body will be nourished. But you are not strong nor is your body nourished, so you don’t exercise often nor eat well.